

# Analysis of Pakistan Studies Curriculum for Secondary Classes in the Context of Civic Education

#### Muhammad Iqbal,

Ph.D. Scholar (Education) Department of Educational Leadership & Management, Faculty of Education, International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan <u>muhammad.phdedu154@iiu.edu.pk</u>

#### Azhar Mahmood,

Associate Professor, Chairperson) Department of Educational Leadership & Management, Faculty of Education, International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan <u>Azhar.mahmood@iiu.edu.pk</u>

#### **Muhammad Zafar Iqbal**

Assistant Professor, Chairperson) Department of Teacher Education, Faculty of Education, International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan <u>m.zafar@iiu.edu.pk</u>

#### Abstract

The present study is aimed at exploring the content about civic education in the enacted curriculum of Pakistan studies for secondary classes in the province of Punjab Pakistan. The objectives of the study are to examine the content about civic education in the curriculum of Pakistan studies at secondary school level and to explore the content about political dimension of civic education in the curriculum of Pakistan Studies for secondary classes. Civic education is backbone of a societal life. There are very few studies available to determine the extent of civic education in the curriculum, In Pakistan there is compulsory or separate subject to instill civic education in the young generation. CE is imparted through the curriculum of Pakistan studies therefore content analysis of Pakistan studies textbooks for grades IX-X, and structured interview protocol was used to collect data from curriculum experts. Pakistan studies curriculum provides multidimensional civic education to the learners.

Keywords: Curriculum, Pakistan Studies. Political Awareness, Civic Education



#### Introduction

The lack of civic education is one of the most significant issues in the modern era. Teachers should encourage an atmosphere in which students feel comfortable discussing and critiquing the cultural and societal norms and values they bring to the classroom with them. (Sultana, 2006) Citizenship education is an essential component of civic, social, cultural, and political life.

Civic education is so vital because the social, political, cultural, and economic well-being of a country is dependent on its inhabitants. For this reason, a country's population are its most valuable resource. In order to construct robust democracies in light of the political, social, and economic realities of the modern world (Naseer, 2014), it is essential for industrialized nations as well as developing countries to make citizenship education a priority and place a strong focus on it. [Citizenship education] is an integral part of the democratic process. It makes sense to make the most of the time that children spend in school by taking advantage of the chance to teach them about civic duty and cultural awareness (Sigauke, 2012; Crick, 1998) because children spend a significant amount of time in school.

A chronology of Pakistan's curriculum reform is a history of the ideological transformations between periods of democracy and military rule of ten years. Each of these time periods saw the introduction of new national curricular policies. To this day, the cycle is still in motion. There are three main epochs when it comes to Islam's role in the education sector: the Islamization era (1948-2006), the secularization and moderation period (2006-2010), and the revival of the Islamization era (2011-present). The process of conversion to Islam began at this time (2010 onwards) (Vaugeleres, 2005). Political, philosophical and educational debates and advancements in education policy can be found in the following sections of this article.

"Citizen Characteristics considered desirable and essential for a functioning democracy" are civic virtues, yet, the Pakistani educational system has failed to teach these virtues in its students (Molina Giron, 2012). Citizenship is always built locally, according to Béné (2005), who argues that "national history and memory, which figure strongly in educational programs, are the fundamental elements that are relied on in the process" (p. 19).

The goal of this study was to investigate Punjab's curriculum policy procedures and practices connected to the implementation of the Pakistan Studies 2006 National Curriculum. The study aimed to better understand teachers' opinions on Pakistani national identity, ethnic and

religious diversity, and global perspectives following the reform of the Pakistan Studies curriculum policy for secondary schools in Punjab.

Textbooks are the primary means of communicating topic information, largely dictating what takes place in a classroom and measuring what students learn or do not learn. Hence our analysis of textbooks in Pakistan was critical (K. Mahmood & Saeed, 2011, p. 503). Many instructors in Punjab believe that government-recommended textbooks are the same as Punjab's curriculum since schools are forced to use them and because the curriculum's formal documentation is not publicly available (Dean, 2005). Teachers also extensively rely on prescribed textbooks due to a lack of available library resources and their sometimes shaky grasp of subject matter (K. Mahmood, 2011; K. Mahmood, Iqbal, & Saeed, 2009). A thorough examination of the content included in textbooks was required due to their importance in the educational process.

## Civic in education in national curriculum

Changing Pakistan's National Curriculum in light of the lessons learned by developed countries may be the best course of action here. The curriculum is the most important tool for instilling desirable traits in students during the educational journey. An educational roadmap that outlines the goals and objectives that must be achieved, the subjects that must be covered and included, and the techniques that must be used for learning, teaching, and evaluation processes" is referred to as a curriculum (Wojtczak, 2002).

It is believed that the term "curriculum" refers to more than most people realize or infer. "Curriculum" cannot be defined as a list of topics expected to be covered in an educational course; rather, a syllabus is more appropriate and acceptable. For the most part, the curriculum is a statement of educational policy. Another idea is that it is an indication and recommendation for carrying out the policy in a plan of action. A curriculum is much more than just these two concepts despite this fact. When imagining its scope, imagine it to be much broader than it is. A more accurate and helpful definition of curriculum would be "the sum of all the activities, experiences, and learning opportunities for which an institution (like the society) or a teacher (i.e., a faculty member) accepts responsibility either consciously or by default," according to this viewpoint. In this definition, the term "curriculum" encompasses more than just formal and informal learning, but also learning that is acknowledged and disregarded, planned and unplanned. It is helpful to think of the curriculum as consisting of three parts: the theoretical curriculum, the practical curriculum, and the curriculum on paper that students get to use and learn from. "Emotional literacy" must be seen as more than behavior management and as a crucial component of a child's ethical upbringing, as it is well known in citizenship education, which places an emphasis on moral growth. But the curriculum document's section on citizenship education will be examined in this study (only curriculum on paper or curriculum in theory).

Pakistan's educational system needs research-based resources, indicating a need to fill the implementation gap in policies and practices that is prevalent in the country. If improving students' critical thinking abilities is a curriculum goal, lesson plans and textbook content should be geared toward this end. To educate students on critical thinking skills, Mahmood (2017) recommends integrating those skills into the course material and giving them lots of practice applying those skills (p.5).

# **Social Studies and Pakistan Studies**

Pakistan Studies is a required course that takes the place of Social Studies in the curriculum of secondary schools up to the bachelor's degree level. This is the case even though Social Studies is taught in elementary and middle schools. In order to improve the education of Pakistani students in history, geography, and economy, these three subjects have been combined into a unified curriculum (M. Ali, 1992). Children in Pakistan are required to take subjects like social studies and Pakistani studies as a matter of custom. These subjects aim to instill a sense of patriotism, good citizenship, and compassion in the Muslim community. These problems can be traced back to Islam because it provides the underlying conceptual structure (I. Ahmad, 2008).

Pakistan Studies in high school seeks to assist pupils in becoming responsible citizens with an awareness of Pakistan's political system and human values. Throughout Pakistan's history, civic education has been mostly ignored, and there needs to be a clear separation between it and Pakistan studies. This kind of curriculum is needed in Pakistan because it is both reasonable and practical for the country's educational system. A well-balanced and effective education system is the best way to ensure political stability because only a system can thrive with adequate education. Many other researchers have also considered politics and education as research topics. A vital part of the concept of sustainable development is to invest in education in order to promote economic growth and democratic continuation. The only way to ensure the long-term sustainability of a democratic system is to ensure it is fair and representative at the same time (Kenneth & Kent, 2014).



In order for a state to have the best citizens who are also politically savvy, a secondary-level political education program is a must. In order to avoid this, there is no way around it. Because of the many study projects available to students, they have been informed about the political process and given the opportunity to engage in it. Young people's participation in politics is a global issue, and numerous organizations around the world are devoted to achieving this aim. Voter turnout in democratic elections has been dropping for some years, and this has sparked some concern. Young people's lack of interest in political matters is particularly worrisome. Education and political participation go hand in hand in the development of political engagement; nonetheless, something terrible has occurred in our educational system (Jan et al, 2011). When people were really concerned about the state of their surroundings, it led to more active engagement in politics. If you're like most people, you believe that more education leads to more information, which leads to more political participation to a person's level of education and literacy, which is bad (Adam, 2010).

## **Statement of the Problem**

Ideological transformations have happened alongside Pakistan's changeable political history, which is why Pakistan Studies is a school topic that teaches secondary school pupils about Pakistan's history, geography, and culture. Students learn about Pakistan's past through studying Pakistan Studies at school. The current article deals with the problem statement as to what is the role of Pakistan Studies in promoting political awareness at the secondary level in Pakistan.

#### Significance of the study:

There is diversity in all walks of life in Pakistani society. Peace, tolerance, and respect are severely lacking in today's Pakistani society. Unfortunately, people' civic sensibilities have not been fostered by any of the usual suspects in citizenship education, including families, schools, and communities. According to research by Hina et al. (2011), students' development of civic virtues is strongly correlated with their level of school engagement.

Understanding the disconnect between theory and reality of civic education in our dear homeland requires an examination of textbooks with regard to alignment of the curriculum based on national objectives. Despite a significant increase in the number of students enrolled in secondary and postsecondary institutions, our educational system is failing to cultivate responsible and engaged citizens. The scope of civic education is rapidly broadening, and it is progressing toward a more global and digitalized form of instruction. The concept of a global community is becoming a tangible reality.

The researcher looked at the textbook used in secondary schools across Pakistan to teach subjects related to Pakistan. What aspects of citizenship education are included is based on this. These aspects of citizenship education and the goals of the National curriculum are taken into account by the content analysis used to evaluate Pakistan studies textbooks. The views of secondary school educators on their pupils' political participation and citizenship behavior are also explored. The study's author hopes to learn how it may improve education for both students and faculty. Understanding the disconnect between theory and reality of civic education in our dear homeland requires an examination of textbooks with regard to alignment of the curriculum based on national objectives. There has been a wonderful increase in the number of students enrolled in secondary and higher education, but our system still struggles to turn out responsible individuals. The scope of civic education is rapidly broadening, and it is progressing toward a more global and digitalized form of instruction. The concept of a global community is becoming a tangible reality.

This research will help educators identify the strengths and limitations of the Pakistan studies textbook used in secondary schools, particularly as it relates to civic education. Given the many facets of citizenship education, this examination can provide educators the leeway to steer class discussion toward topics that expose students to new possibilities, problems, and national or international issues.

Furthermore, educational institutions, teachers, parents, administration, and educational boards will benefit from this research.

# **Objectives of the study / Research Questions**

This study was designed to achieve the following objectives:

- 1. To examine the content about civic education in the curriculum of Pakistan studies at secondary school level
- 2. To explore the content about political dimension of civic education in the curriculum of Pakistan Studies for secondary classes

# **Research Questions**

The concerned study deals with the following research questions.

- 1. To what extent does the curriculum of Pakistan studies for secondary classes provide civic education
- 2. To what extent does, the curriculum of Pakistan studies at secondary school promotes awareness about political dimension of civic education in the students of secondary classes?

#### Literature Review

Memorization is prioritized above critical thinking in the educational system therefore students are not taught how to think critically. A lack of hands-on political experience is not provided in the course of instruction. As a result, Pakistani pupils lack the basic political knowledge and awareness they require. Pupils get disconnected from their community's problems as a result of this situation. Even if this is just the first step in the process, the kids' political awareness may develop and they may become more involved and educated members of society, even if this is just the first step (GOP, 2002). Students' socialization is greatly aided by education, which is often recognized as a powerful instrument. Doing so is accomplished in part by instilling pupils with the ideals of society and politics, raising their political awareness, and helping them to fulfill their civic responsibilities in a way that helps their country progress. Over the course of a single night, it's impossible to instill a political idea in young people. Everybody understands the importance of educational institutions and schools in the lives of their children. This process can be influenced significantly by the schools the students attend, which can have a significant impact on the students' morals and mentalities (David, 1963).

Secondary school students' development of political consciousness can vary widely and is frequently influenced by a variety of factors, including their teachers, peers, classmates, and the immediate surroundings. Students in secondary schools often believe that being politically active and knowledgeable are the responsibilities of adults, and that students who believe this are uninformed about their own responsibilities. Many secondary school students follow the political beliefs of their parents and other family members blindly rather than forming their own opinions (William, 2007). Whether or not a social studies teacher is doing their job properly can be brought into question if they have a tendency to accept other people's points of view without critically examining their own. Social studies teachers are expected to instill students with a sense of civic responsibility and political awareness, and to keep them updated on the customs, values and beliefs of their country.

After East Pakistan became a sovereign state and renamed Bangladesh in 1971, the primary goal of this academic discipline was to instill a sense of patriotism and good citizenship in its students. From 5 July 1977 to 17 August 1988, Pakistan was under the authority of General Muhammad Zia-Ul-Haq, who implemented an Islamization program that promoted a single and homogeneous view of Pakistan's history, culture, and religion with Islam at its core in the educational system. A new programmer secondary Pakistan studies was implemented in 2006 by the Musharraf regime, which was in office from 12 October 1999 until 18 August 2008 and had a stronger lean toward liberal democratic values. There is a general consensus that this new strategy has a more democratic and pluralistic objective. However, a shift in Pakistan's educational strategy has resulted in a greater emphasis on the country's diverse ethnic and religious populations. Consequently, it aimed to teach young people how to participate in democratic societies and worldwide communities in a responsible manner. This was in addition to the goal of educating future generations about the importance of human rights. Although many politicians, textbook authors, and educators were committed to the conventional manner of teaching Pakistan Studies, the new policy discourse was in direct opposition with their views. By utilising the policy trajectory framework (Ball et al., 2012) and by focusing on the themes of Pakistani national identity, ethnic and religious diversity and global perspectives this research sought to gain a better understanding of the Pakistan Studies curriculum policy trajectory in various policy contexts in the Punjab region of Pakistan. In 2012, Ball et al. established the policy trajectory framework (Bowe et al, 1992). Because Pakistani society is heavily influenced by these issues, past studies focused on them. A macro-level understanding of the context of text production was gained by analyzing the discourses influencing the formulation of the new curriculum policy. As part of this study, the National Curriculum for Pakistan Studies 2006 and other pertinent policy materials were examined (the context of influence). Using secondary school textbooks on Pakistan Studies, this study tries to gain a deeper understanding of the context in which text development occurs. They are used to educate children about Pakistan. Teachers' attitudes and activities were also examined in order to gain a better knowledge of the education system as a whole.

We are losing ground in our educational system when it comes to teaching students about politics, civics, and other aspects of political culture. Our public school system's educational curriculum is not being developed in conformity with contemporary democratic theories, according to a vast number of studies. There are many educational institutions in the United States that do not have a democratic culture or a healthy work environment. It was possible

170



that a democratic curriculum could close the gap, but its failure to do so has resulted in a lack of democratic views among students and faculty at educational institutions. As a result, no progress has been made in closing the divide. If political culture had been cultivated in the educational framework, the situation could have been saved and a new democratic leadership could have been developed (Alexander, 2013).

Pakistan studies curriculum for Grades IX-X is consisted of the chapters, Ideology of Pakistan, Creation of Pakistan, Islamic Republic of Pakistan, Pakistan Soil, History of Pakistan I-II, Foreign Relations of Pakistan, Economic Development, Population, society, and culture of Pakistan, Protection of women.

## **Research Methodology**

#### **Research Design**

The researcher has adopted a qualitative research design. Qualitative research design is a methodological approach to defining a research problem in-depth and clarity

#### Population

The current study was delimited to only Punjab province; therefore, the population of the particular study consisted of all the curriculum experts and the National Curriculum (2006) of Pakistan studies for Grades IX-X. It was consisted of 27 curriculum experts,

#### Sample

Fifteen curriculum experts and the written text books of Pakistan Studies for Grades IX\_X was a qualitative sample of the study.

#### **Research instrument**

Thematic analysis protocol was developed to analyze the civic education content in the curriculum of Pakistan studies for secondary classes in the province of Punjab, Pakistan. Structured interview protocol was developed to seek collect data from curriculum experts. validity and reliability.

| S.NO | Variables                 | items | Cronbach's Alpha | Consistency |
|------|---------------------------|-------|------------------|-------------|
| 1    | Civil Dimension           | 3     | .82              | Good        |
| 2    | Political Dimension       | 3     | .71              | Acceptable  |
| 3    | Socio Economic            | 3     | .90              | Excellent   |
| 4    | Cultural Dimension        | 2     | .80              | Good        |
| 5    | Curriculum of Pak Studies | 2     | .72              | Acceptable  |
| 6    | Five Variables            | 13    | .81              | Good        |

# Table 1Cronbach's Alpha and Internal Consistency of the Tool

#### **Discussion and Analysis**

The data gathered through the thematic analysis through content analysis and semi structured interview contributed positively to find out the answers of Research questions. While curriculums specify the desired learning goals, instructional materials provide suggestions for how those outcomes can be achieved. National policies must be in line with the curriculum's objectives, which are then followed by the educational objectives. A lack of resources, a lack of professional quality in teachers, and a lack of understanding are all issues that contribute to Pakistan's implementation gap (Mahmood, 2017). School curricula are designed to promote critical thinking, but teachers may be unable to achieve this goal because students lack higher-order thinking skills and educators are unable to teach them (Cassum, McGrath, Gul, Dilshad, & Syeda, 2013). Students' critical thinking abilities must be developed and strengthened in textbooks, the most significant part of the educational process. Thus, textbooks make up the vast majority of the course material (Irafahmi, Nuris, Zahroh, &Nagari, 2018). A high-quality curriculum and textbook must be utilized in concert with high-quality educators in order to develop a large number of high-quality learners. Instructors with fewer or no years of expertise can use textbooks as a set of instructions. There are several benefits to doing evaluation of textbooks, such as improving the goals of education, documenting the program, and refining it based on the findings of evaluations.

#### Analysis of Ninth Grade Pakistan Studies Textbook

Among the five sections of this course were Ideological Foundations of Islamism in Pakistan, The Making of Islamism in the Modern World, Pakistan's Land and Environment, Pakistan's History, and the Promotion and Protection of Women's Rights in Pakistan. Before beginning each chapter, students were given a set of predetermined learning outcomes and given information that was related to the same central theme. Multiple choice, fill in the gaps, short

172

answer and comprehensive answers were presented as exercises at the end of each chapter in the textbook. These tasks are included at the end of the chapter. By analyzing each form of question using Bloom's taxonomy at each of its six levels, this study was able to evaluate whether or not text-based questions promote critical thinking skills.

The majority of Pakistanis hailed the 18th constitutional amendment as a win for democracy and lauded it as a move in the right direction by Pakistani civil society (Centre for Civic Education Pakistan, 2010). Pakistan's efforts to integrate its diverse people and maintain its national character were threatened by the adoption of curriculum content in various regions of the country, notwithstanding this. Students in Pakistani schools may find it more difficult to discuss important topics like national identity, global citizenship, and personal identity if this is done this way. There would be discrepancies between the methods used was foreseeable.

Because it's evident that teaching students to think critically is an educational goal in the 21st century, whether in affluent countries like Pakistan or less developed ones like those like Pakistan, Teachers, schools, and textbooks should all be geared toward developing critical thinkers in students, and educators need to learn how to promote critical thinkers.

#### **Conclusion and Recommendation**

Pakistan studies is useful for personal and ethical grounds. It promotes people's belief that everyone has equal rights, worth, and value in society, which advances equality. Using dignity to build strong ties helps accomplish justice.

# **Political Sensitivity**

Pakistan studies covers most political information. This book's historical, famous, and political background knowledge helps secondary school students. It allows individuals to pay attention to political ideas and learn more about political parties' conceptions, aims, purposes, and ambitions as part of its countrywide strategy. Politics may have turned off many people. If used properly, political awareness may be a force for good, a tool for achieving organizational goals, and a vital life skill.

#### Respect

Civic education promotes community respect and responsibility. It produces exceptional respect for others' wants, feelings, and rights. Respect for our national heroes, elders, country,



rules and laws, teachers, and martyrs is valued in Pakistan studies. It also fosters deep respect for others' qualities, abilities, sacrifices, and achievements.

## **Civic Knowledge**

Civic education teaches students about rights, humanity, values, ethics, respect, dignity, and national excellence. Civic knowledge is taught to promote loyalty, belonging, and the government. Politics, collectivism, and patriotism require civic education. It also emphasizes personal and public acts that benefit people and the community. Civic duty encompasses these duties. To acquire well-informed ideas, understand government, and participate in civic and political life, students require a strong civic foundation. Studying essential civic papers, incorporating them in Pakistan studies, and providing concepts that allow in-depth discussion of important social issues and significant connections between the past and present might achieve this. The current curriculum encourages students to engage communities, create strong social links, and read policy papers on the country's norms and values to preserve an awareness of the national law of excellence and civic knowledge.

## **Content Analysis**

The following chapters in 9th and 10th-grade textbooks covered the themes above:

Chapter 6: This chapter emphasizes social relationships, societal problems, the political process, politics, country laws, and laws that promote respect and culture.

# **Course Materials.**

Civics, politics, respect, and dignity are included in curricular documents. The curriculum papers emphasize civic education to educate Punjabi secondary school pupils about their nation's political, social, moral, cultural, and economic elements. Children should also know the nation's history.

#### Recommendations

- 1. A study to identify the perceptions of teacher may be conducted to explore the effects of Pakistan studies curriculum in parting civic education in the learners.
- 2. Practical knowledge and required skills for a stable democracy may be included in the curriculum.

#### References

- Adam J. B., & Gabriel S. L. (2010). *Education and Political Participation: Exploring the Causal Link*, Springer Science Business Media, LLC.
- Ali, M. (1992). Akbar in Pakistani textbooks. Social Scientist, 20(9/10), 73-76.
- Ahmed, I. (2008). Pakistan's national identity. *International Review of Modern Sociology*, 34(1), 47-59.
- Alexander, R. (2013). *Curriculum Freedom, Capacity and Leadership in the Primary School*.Nottingham: National College for School Leadership
- Ball, S. J., Maguire, M., & Braun, A. (2012). *How schools do policy: Policy enactments in secondary schools*. New York: Routledge.
- Bryman, A. (2012). Social research method (4th ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bénéï, V. (2005). *Manufacturing citizenship: Education and nationalism in Europe, South Asia and China*. New York: Routledge.
- Cho, Y. J., & Lee, H.-E. (2014). Reducing Confusion about Grounded Theory and Qualitative Content Analysis: Similarities and Differences. *The Qualitative Report*, 19(64), 1-20.
- Cleaver, E. & Nelson, J. (2006) Active citizenship: from policy to practice. *Education Journal*, 98(2), 34-37.
- David, Z. (1963). *Public School Politics*, Institute for Community Development and Services, Michigan State University.
- Dean, B. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities. International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education, 1(2), 35-55.
- Forman, J., & Damschroder, L. (2007). Qualitative content analysis. *Empirical Methods For Bioethics: A Primer, 11*(1), 39-62.
- Francis, T. (2018). Improving curriculum alignment and achieving learning goals by making the curriculum visible. Taylor & Francis.
- Fraser, S., & Bosanquet, A. M. (2006). The curriculum? That's just a unit outline, isn't it? Studies in Higher Education, 31(3), 269–284. doi:10.1080/03075070600680521
- Glatthorn, Allan A. (2002) The Principal as Curriculum Leader: Shaping What Is Taught & Tested. 2nd ed.
- Granehim, H. U., Lindgren, M. B., & Lundman, B. (2017). Methodological Challenges in Qualitative Content Analysis: A Discussion Paper. *Nurse education today*, 56(1), 29-34.
- Government of Pakistan. (2012). Objectives of Punjab textbook board. Retrieved from <u>http://ptb.gop.pk/ArtDetail.aspx</u>

- Irafahmi, D. T., Nuris, D. M., Zahroh, F., & Nagari, P. M. (2018). Critical thinking in accounting textbooks. *Journal of Education and Learning*, *12*(1), 21-29.
- Jan W. van Deth, Abendschön, S., & Vollmar, M. (2010). Children and Politics: An Empirical Reassessment of Early Political Socialization, *Political Psychology*, *32*(1).
- Kenneth P. L., & Kent, J. (2014). Political Socialization and High School Curriculum in the United States, *American Political Review*, 62(3).
- Mahmood, K., & Saeed, M. (2011). Ensuring textbook quality through evaluation: An issue in Pakistan. *Literacy Information and Computer Education Journal (LICEJ)*, 2(4), 503-512
- Molina Giron, L. A. (2012). Educating Good Citizens: A Case Study of Citizenship Education in Four Multicultural High School Classrooms in Ontario. (NR98291 Ph.D.), University of Ottawa (Canada), Ann Arbor. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses A&I database.
- Moretti, F., van Vliet, L., Bensing, J., Deledda, G., Mazzi, M., Rimondini, M., ... & Fletcher, I. (2011). A standardized approach to qualitative content analysis of focus group discussions from different countries. *Patient education and counseling*, 82(3), 420-428
- Shreier, M. (2012). Qualitative content analysis in practice. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Veugelers, W. (2011). Theory and practice of CE. The case of policy, Science and education in Netherlands. *Revista de Education nulmeroextraordinario*, 6 (3), 207-224.
- Veugelers, W., Derrikd, M. & Kat, E. De (2005). Active participation of students and citizenship education. De PedagogischeDimensie, 42. Amsterdam: University of Amsterdam.
- Wojtczak, A. (2002). *Glossary of Medical Education Terms*, <u>http://www.iime.org/glossary.htm</u>, accessed 2 February (2022).